



Mini Review

**PRESENCE OF ENDOCRINE DISRUPTING CHEMICALS
 IN THE CITY OF KARACHI**

Muhammad Z Khan

629 East Columbia Street, New Westminster BC V3L 3Y2, Canada

INTRODUCTION

Xenobiotics are the harmful chemical substances foreign to the body of living organisms. They can enter in the living body from sources like environmental contaminants, domestic waste, sewerage waste and industrial effluents. These compounds have the ability to disturb the natural physiological mechanisms of the body by disturbing the naturally occurring hormonal system. Therefore, these compounds (or chemicals) are termed as Endocrine Disturbing Chemicals (EDCs). There are about

85,000 chemical products present in the environment, while about 1,000 are declared as EDCs (Street *et al.*, 2018). Many plastic making companies use phthalates, bisphenol A and Plasticizers in manufacturing their products. Many other chemicals such as flameretardants, industrial chemicals, alkylphenols, metals and dioxins are also added to the environment from different sources (Street *et al.*, 2018). Table 1 Lists of 45 EDCs that have been published by United Nations. The list includes phthalates, bisphenols and parabens.

Table 1. List of 45 Endocrine Disrupting Chemicals (EDCs). (Source: chemicalwatch.com; WHO, 2012).

4-Nonylphenol, branched and linear	Carbon disulphide
4-Nonylphenol, branched and linear, ethoxylated	Metam-sodium
4-(1,1,3,3-tetramethylbutyl)phenol	Zineb
4-(1,1,3,3-tetramethylbutyl)phenol, ethoxylated	Ziram
4-Heptylphenol, branched and linear	Thiram
p-(1,1-dimethylpropyl) phenol	Tert-butyl methyl ether; MTBE; 2-methoxy-2-methylpropane
Bis(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate; DEHP	Methyl4paraben
Diisobutyl phthalate; DIBP	Ethylparaben
Dibutyl phthalate; DBP	Propylparaben; propyl 4-hydroxybenzoate
Benzyl butyl phthalate; BBP	Butylparaben; butyl 4-hydroxybenzoate
Resbenzophenone	4-nitrophenol
Benzophenone-2; 2,2',4,4'- tetrahydroxybenzophenone	2,4,6-tribromophenol
Benzophenone-3; Oxybenzone	Resorcinol
4,4'-dihydroxybenzophenone	Pentachlorophenol (PCP)

3-Benzylidene camphor (3-BC); (phenylmethylene)bicyclo[2.2.1]heptan-2-one	1,7,7-trimethyl-3-	Tebuconazole
3-(4-Methylbenzylidene) camphor; methylene]bicyclo[2.2.1] heptan-2-one	1,7,7-trimethyl-3-[(4-methylphenyl)	Triclosan
2-ethylhexyl 4-methoxycinnamate		Diethyl phthalate (DEP)
Bisphenol F		Dihexyl phthalate (DHP)
Bisphenol S		Dicyclohexyl phthalate (DCHP)
Butylated hydroxytoluene		Diocetyl phthalate (DOP)
Tert.-Butylhydroxyanisole (BHA); tertbutyl-4-methoxyphenol		Diisodecyl phthalate (DiDP)
Quadrosilan; 2,6-cisDiphenylhexamethylcyclotetrasiloxane		Diundecyl phthalate (DuDP), branched and linear
		Triphenyl phosphate

A report published by World Health Organization and Endocrine Society mentions the undesirable effects of Endocrine Disturbing Chemicals on human health (WHO, 2018; Diamanti-Kandarakis *et al.*, 2009; Gore *et al.*, 2015). Severe physiological disorders are found in people inhabiting areas with high concentrations of EDCs. EDCs bring about changes in the functions of endocrine systems that can directly impact the hormonal secretions and ultimately human health. These compounds can cause abnormal developmental processes, irregularities in the reproductive cycles, neuro endocrinological disorders, impaired growth, thyroid problems and irregular metabolic activities. This can even lead to cancer due to hormonal imbalance. Therefore, it is imperative that the levels of EDCs in environment are regulated (Duk-Hee Lee, 2018).

According to Khan *et al.* (2017) EDCs alter hormonal functions by affect in gendogenous hormonal mechanism of secretion, binding and transportation. EDCs enter the environment from the use of pesticides, detergents, medicinal waste, sewerage waste, municipal effluents and agricultural waste. They impact the aquatic environment which becomes unsuitable for the survival of different species inhabiting it. Anthropogenic activities cause accumulation of these EDCs in the aquatic environment (Maha, 2016).

Following researcher have reported on the adverse effects of EDCs on human health and different species in wildlife: Moccia *et al.* (1981, 1986), Reijnders (1986), Colborn *et al.* (1993), Ankley and Giesy (1998), Tyler *et al.* (1998), Van Der Kraak (1998), deFur *et al.* (1999), IPCS (2002), Jobling and Tyler (2003), Matthiessen (2003), Canesi *et al.* (2004), Myers *et al.* (2004), Zala and Penn, (2004), Mills and Chichester (2005), Waring and Harris (2005), Porte *et al.* (2006), Bergman *et al.*

(2012), Hunter *et al.* (2012), Kortenkamp *et al.* (2012), Heindel *et al.* (2015), Khan *et al.* (2017), Peter *et al.* (2018) and Street *et al.* (2018). The effects of EDCs on wildlife has been reviewed in this paper with specific reference to the environment of Karachi city.

The effects of EDCs were observed in fishes and birds as most of the aquatic species are effected due to direct exposure of chemical effluents. The abnormality in thyroid secretions also leads to the infertility. Egg laying ability and fecundity level also decrease. Studies have revealed that in turtles, fishes, and birds the embryonic development is also effected by EDCs (Colborn *et al.*, 1993). According to Myers *et al.* (2004) presence of EDCs in the environment has adverse health effects in inhabitants of that environment.

According to Colborn *et al.* (1993) there were many abnormalities found in Bald Eagles who had accumulated EDCs in their tissues. The studies were also carried out in the Salmon fishes belonging to lakes of Canada and USA. It found that Salmon fishes suffered from many physiological disorders included enlargement of thyroid glands, decrease in thyroid secretions, as well as undeveloped or poorly developed eggs. Bergman *et al.* (2012), Kortenkamp *et al.* (2012) and Khan *et al.* (2017) also studied the effects of EDCs in wildlife.

Other researchers including Myers *et al.* (2004) and Heindel *et al.* (2015) also studied the epidemiological effects of EDCs on wildlife and human health. While Moccia *et al.* (1981, 1986), Reijnders (1986) and Colborn *et al.* (1993) discussed the effects of EDCs on the environment as well as their effects on thyroid functions in birds and fishes. Parr and Kidd (2005) studied the effects of estrogen exposure on amphibians in lakes of Canada. It was found that the reproductive capability as

well as metamorphosis in amphibians have been effected. Experiments were performed on Green frogs (*Rana clamitans*) and larvae of Wild mink frog (*Rana septentrionalis*). Tada *et al.* (2007) studied the effects of VTG induction in freshwater turtles (*Chinemys reevesii*) from the ponds with sewage water contamination containing estrogens (E2) of 0.52–1.7 ng/L.

DISCUSSION

Karachi city is the main industrial hub of Pakistan. With a high population of about 30 million, the city produces millions of tons of domestic waste as well as industrial

waste. Many industries dump their effluents in Lyari and Malir Rivers. A large quantity of contaminated water with toxic chemicals is released into the Arabian Sea. Many trace elements were found in samples of water from Karachi harbor (WWF-Pakistan, 2007). Karachi's Coastal area is effected with industrial and domestic environmental pollutants.

A research was carried out by Khan *et al.* (2007) to determine the *in vitro* yeast estrogenic screen in wastewater from Karachi. It was found that EDCs level was high in Pak colony area which is located in between industrial area (Table 2).

Table 2. Estrogenic activities of seven different wastewater sites in the Karachi region.

Location, sample name	Predicted estrodial equivalence concentration (M)	Predicted estrodial equivalence concentration (ng/L)
Gulshan-e-Iqbal, site A	5.35E-12	1.46
Shorab Goth, site B	7.88E-12	2.15
Gabol Town North Karachi, site C	2.79E-12	0.76
Pak Colony, site D	2.74E-11	7.47
Lasbella, site E	2.82E-12	0.77
Machar Colony, site F	4.55E-13	0.12
Liaquatabad, site G	7.68E-13	0.21

There are cattle farms in Korangi Creek area who dump their waste including blood and organic waste into the Korangi Creek. Level of contaminants in coastal areas of Karachi were also observed by Shahzad *et al.* (2009) and

Saleem and Kazi (1998). According to Siddiqui *et al.* (2017) high levels of toxic chemicals has been found from the Korangi Creek areas (Figs. 1 and 2).



Fig. 1. View of polluted area in Korangi Creek.



Fig. 2. Korangi Creek polluted area.

According to Amjad and Rizvi (2000) 25% of contaminants are dumped into Lyari River while 59% of pollutants are dumped into Malir River from Karachi city. Gharo Creek, Gizri Creek and Korangi Creek are the main channels for discharge of waste. Hunter *et al.* (2012) reported estrogenic activity in soft tissues of mussel from coastal areas of Karachi. Estrogenic activity at Buleji point 1 was 8.91 ± 4.77 ng E2 equivalents/g, Paradise point 1 had 1.72 ± 0.81 ng E2 equivalents/g and Paradise point 2 had 0.61 ± 0.84 ng E2 equivalents/g. Estrogenic compounds were found higher in Korangi Creek as compared to samples from Manora Island.

EDCs also have adverse effects on food chains. It has a disastrous effect on biodiversity, their reproductive patterns and their physiological functions. Khan *et al.* (2017) studied the effects of EDCs in fish (*Engraulis purava*) as well as in mussel (*Mytilus*). High levels of contamination was found in Baba Island where Anchovy had 95.78ng E2 equivalents/g wet weight of fish tissue and in Sandspit (Fig. 3) it was 20.70ng E2/g of fish tissue. Second highest contaminant levels were found in Korangi Creek with average of 77.19ng E2 equivalents/g of fish tissues.



Fig. 3. View of Sandspit beach polluted with plastic and other domestic materials.

Recently, Siddiqi *et al.* (2017) conducted a study on multi-residue screening of endocrine disrupting chemicals (Pesticides and PCBs) in the marine environment of Karachi. Evaluating the bio concentration evidence and preferred sources of these chemicals, they reported that 12 pesticides and 9PCBs were analyzed in 38 different species of fish, crabs, mollusks, echinoderms and shrimps from six different locations from Karachi coastline. Concentration levels of EDCs at all sampling locations

were below the extraneous residue limit and maximum residue limits of codex alimentarius commission of FAO-WHO and US-FDA. But according to the US EPA, screening guidelines, concentration levels of Σ DDTs and Σ PCBs were found higher than their set limits in samples from two locations; Korangi Creek and Fish Harbor (Fig. 4). Based on this study levels of EDCs are still low to the amounts reported from other parts of the world



Fig. 4. Environmental effluents entering Korangi Creek.

REFERENCES

Amjad, S. and Rizvi, SHN. 2000. Pakistan National Program of Action under the Global Program of Action for the protection of marine environment from land based activities. Ministry of Environment and Local Government / National Institute of Oceanography. Karachi.

Ankley, GT. and Giesy, JP. 1998. Endocrine disruptors in wildlife: a weight-of evidence perspective. In: Principles and processes for evaluating endocrine disruption in wildlife. Eds. Kendall, R., Dickerson, R., Giesy, JP. and Suk, W. Pensacola: SETAC Press. 349-367.

Bergman, Å., Heinde, IJJ., Jobling, S., Kidd, KA., Zoeller, RT. (Eds.). 2012. State of the Science of Endocrine Disrupting Chemicals. Geneva: World Health Organization. pp289.

Colborn, T., Frederick, S., vom Saal. and Ana M. Soto. 1993. Developmental Effects of Endocrine-Disrupting Chemicals in Wildlife and Humans. Environmental Health Perspectives. 101:378-84. <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1519860/?page=1> (Accessed Oct 1, 2018).

- Canesi, L., Ciacci, C., Betti, M., Lorusso, LC., Marchi, B., Burattini, S., Falcieri, E. and Gallo, G. 2004⁸. Rapid Effect of 17beta-estradiol on cell signaling and function of *Mytilus* hemocytes. Gen. Comp. Endocrinol. 136:58-71.
- Chemical Watch. 2018. UN list of Endocrine Disruptors. www.chemicalwatch.com/68296/un-publishes-list-of-identified-endocrine-disruptors
- deFur, PL., Crane, M., Ingersoll, C. and Tattersfield, L. 1999. Endocrine disruption in invertebrates: endocrinology, testing, and assessment. Proceedings of the workshops on endocrine disruption in invertebrates. December 12–15 1998. Noordwijkerhout, The Netherlands. Pensacola, FL: SETAC Press.
- Diamanti-Kandarakis, E., Bourguignon, JP., Giudice, LC., Hauser, R., Prins, GS., Soto, AM., Zoeller, RT. and Gore, AC. 2009. Endocrine-Disrupting Chemicals: An Endocrine Society Scientific Statement, Endocrine Reviews. 30(4):293-342. <https://doi.org/10.1210/er.2009-0002>.
- Duk-Hee Lee. 2018. Evidence of the Possible Harm of Endocrine-Disrupting Chemicals in Humans: Ongoing Debates and Key Issues. Endocrinol Metab (Seoul). 33(1): 44-52.
- Gore, AC., Chappell, VA., Fenton, SE., Flaws, JA., Nadal, A., Prins, GS., Toppari, J. and Zoeller, RT. 2015. Executive Summary to EDC-2: The Endocrine Society's Second Scientific Statement on Endocrine-Disrupting Chemicals, Endocrine Reviews. 36(6):593-602, <https://doi.org/10.1210/er.2015-1093>.
- Hunter, S., Khan, MZ., Ben, HHS., Doerr, B., Sara, A. and Law, FCP. 2012. Assessing Estrogenic Chemicals in Anchovy and Mussel Samples from Karachi, Pakistan with the Yeast Estrogen Screen Bioassay. Bulletin of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology. 89(5):990-994, DOI:10.1007/s00128-012-0821-6.
- Heindel, JJ., vom Saal, FS., Blumberg, B., Bovolín, P., Calamandrei, G., Ceresini, G., Cohn, BA., Fabbri, E., Gioiosa, L., Kassotis, C., et al. 2015. Parma consensus statement on metabolic disruptors. Environ. Health. 14: 54.
- IPCS. 2002. Global assessment of the state-of-the-science of endocrine disruptors. International Program on Chemical Safety, World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland.
- Jobling, S. and Tyler, CR. 2003. Endocrine disruption in wild freshwater fish. Pure Appl Chem. 75:2219-2234.
- Khan, MZ, Nelson, J., Law, FCP., Leung, W. and Hao-Feng (Howie), Lai . 2007. Assessment of Estrogenic Contamination using *in-vitro* Yeast Estrogenic Screen in the Wastewater of Karachi. Canadian Journal of Pure and Applied Sciences. 1(1):67-72.
- Kortenkamp, A., Evans, R., Martin, O., McKinlay, R., Orton, F. and Rosivatz, E. 2012. State of the art assessment of endocrine disruptors. Report to the European Commission, Brussels. pp486.
- Khan, MZ., Ali, F., Louie, A., Zehra, A., Gabol, K., Kanwal, R., Yasmeen, G., Iqbal, MA., Manzoor, U., Ullah, U. and Law, FCP. 2017. Extent of fish and mussel species contaminated by endocrine disrupting chemicals (EDCs) in Karachi Coastal Areas: Assessment using an *in-vitro* yeast estrogenic screening (YES) test. Canadian Journal of Pure and Applied Sciences. 11(1):4067-4077.
- Matthiessen, P. 2003. An historical perspective on endocrine disruption in wildlife. Pure Appl Chem. 75:2197-21206.
- Myers, JP., Guillette, LJ. Jr., Palanza, P., Parmigiani, S., Swan, SH. and vom Saal, FS. 2004. The emerging science of endocrine disruption. In: International Seminars on Planetary Emergencies, 30th Session. Ed. Ragaini, RC. World Scientific Publishing: London, UK. 105–121.
- Mills, LJ. and Chichester, C. 2005. Review of evidence: are endocrine-disrupting chemicals in the aquatic environment impacting fish populations? Sci Tot Environ. 343:1-34.
- Maha Ahmed Mohamed Abdallah. 2016. Endocrine Disruptors as Pollutants in Marine Ecosystem: A Case Study in Egypt. The Open Biotechnology Journal. 10:131-150
- Moccia, RD., Fox, GA. and Britton, A. 1986. A quantitative assessment of thyroid histopathology of Herring gulls (*Larus argentatus*) from the Great Lakes and a hypothesis on the causal role of environmental contaminants. J Wildl Dis. 22(1):60-70.
- Moccia, RD., Leatherland, JF. and Sonstegard, RA. 1981. Quantitative interlake comparison of thyroid pathology in Great Lakes coho (*Oncorhynchus kisutch*) and Chinook (*Oncorhynchus tshawytscha*) salmon. Cancer Res. 41(6):2200-2210.
- Park, BJ. and Kidd K. 2005. Effects of the synthetic estrogen ethinylestradiol on early life stages of mink frogs and green frogs in the wild and in situ. Environ Toxicol Chem. 24:2027–2036.

- Porte, C., Janer, G., Lorusso, L.C., Ortiz-Zarragoitia M., Cajarville, M.P., Fossi, M.C. and Canesi, L. 2006. Endocrine disruptors in marine organisms: Approaches and perspectives. *Comp Toxicol Pharmacol.* 143:303-315.
- Peter, M., James, R., Wheeler, and Lennart, W. 2018. A review of the evidence for endocrine disrupting effects of current-use chemicals on wildlife populations. *Critical Reviews in Toxicology.* 48(3):195-216, DOI: 10.1080/10408444.2017.1397099.
- Reijnders, P.J. 1986. Reproductive failure in common seals feeding on fish from polluted coastal waters. *Nature.* 324(6096):456-457.
- Siddiqi, H.A., Munshi, A.B. and Farhan, A. 2017. Multiresidue Screening of Endocrine Disrupting Chemicals (Pesticides & Pcb's) in the Marine Environment of Karachi: Evaluating the Bioconcentration Evidences and Preferred Sources of these Chemicals. *J. Chem. Soc. Pak.* 39(5): 851-861.
- Street, M.E., Angelini, S., Bernasconi, S., Burgio, E., Cassio, A., Catellani, C., Cirillo, F., Deodati, A., Fabbri, E., Fanos, V., Gargano, G., Grossi, E., Iughetti, L. *et al.* 2018. Current Knowledge on Endocrine Disrupting Chemicals (EDCs) from Animal Biology to Humans, from Pregnancy to Adulthood: Highlights from a National Italian Meeting. *Int. J. Mol. Sci.* 19(6). 1647; doi:10.3390/ijms19061647.
- Shahzad, A., Khan, M.A., Shaukat, S. and Ahmed, W. 2009. Chemical pollution profile of Rehri Creek area, Karachi (Sindh). *J Chem Soc Pak* 31:592-600.
- Saleem, M. and Kazi, G.H. 1998. Concentration and distribution of heavy metals (lead, cadmium, copper, nickel, zinc) in Karachi shore and offshore sediments. *Pak J Mar Sci* 7:71-79.
- Tyler, C.R., Jobling, S. and Sumpter, J.P. 1998. Endocrine disruption in wildlife: a critical review of the evidence. *Crit Rev Toxicol.* 28:319-361.
- Tada, N., Saka, M., Shiraishi, F. and Kamata, Y. 2007. A field study on serum vitellogenin levels in male Reeves' pond turtles (*Chinemys reevesii*) from estrogen-contaminated sites and a reference site. *Sci Tot Environ.* 384:205-213.
- Van Der Kraak, G. 1998. Natural and anthropogenic environmental oestrogens: the scientific basis for risk assessment. Observations of endocrine effects in wildlife with evidence of their causation. *Pure Appl Chem.* 70:1785-1794.
- Waring, R.H. and Harris, R.M. 2005. Endocrine disruptors: A human risk? *Molecular and Cellular Endocrinology* 244:2-9.
- WWF-Pakistan. 2007. Pakistan's waters at risk: water and health related issues in Pakistan. Lahore Pakistan: Freshwater & Toxics Program World Wildlife Fund Pakistan. Retrieved from <http://www.wfpak.org/pdf/water-report.pdf>
- World Health Organization. The state-of-the-science of endocrine disrupting chemicals 2012 [Internet] Geneva: WHO; c2018. [cited 2018 Feb 21]. Available from: <http://www.who.int/ceh/publications/endocrine/en/index.html>.
- Zala, S.M. and Penn, D.J. 2004. Abnormal behaviours induced by chemical pollution: a review of the evidence and new challenges. *Anim Behav.* 68:649-664.

Received: April 20, 2018; Revised and Accepted: September 28, 2018

Copyright©2017, This is an open access article distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution Non Commercial License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.